

Power Grab: Political Survival Through Extractive Resource Nationalization

Paasha Mahdavi

Contents

List of Figures	iii
List of Tables	vi
Acknowledgments	ix
1 The puzzle of extractive resource nationalization	1
1.1 What is extractive resource nationalization?	5
1.2 The political economy of resource nationalization	9
1.3 Summary of the argument	18
1.3.1 Diffusion of negotiating information leads to greater nationalization	21
1.3.2 Nationalization fosters fiscal strength	25
1.3.3 Nationalizing operations increases leadership survival .	30
1.4 Research design, methodology, and measuring nationalization .	32
1.4.1 Chapter outline: a road map for the rest of the book .	36
2 The theory of political survival through nationalization	41
2.1 How does natural resource nationalization affect governance? .	43
2.1.1 Theories of natural resource wealth and political de- velopment	44
2.1.2 Does natural resource wealth always hinder development? .	46
2.1.3 Theorizing nationalization within resource politics . . .	48
2.1.4 Alternatives to why leaders nationalize: bargaining, institutions, and ideology	50
2.1.5 Time inconsistency and the natural resources trap . . .	52
2.1.6 Degrees of nationalization at different points in time .	54
2.2 The operational nationalization theory	57

2.2.1	Information diffusion as the spark for nationalization	62
2.2.2	Consequences of different degrees of state intervention	67
2.2.3	Implications and predictions	84
2.3	Initial empirical evidence	87
2.3.1	Pahlavi Iran before the fall	88
2.3.2	Ba'athist consolidation in Iraq	91
2.4	Conclusion	95
3	Defining and measuring operational nationalization	99
3.1	Measuring nationalization	99
3.1.1	Timing and duration of nationalization: NOCs	100
3.1.2	Institutional characteristics: not all NOCs are the same	104
3.2	Comparison to existing data on state ownership of petroleum	108
3.3	Conclusion	111
4	Why nationalize? Evidence from national oil companies around the world	113
4.1	What factors determine oil nationalization?	116
4.1.1	Implications of the operational nationalizations theory	120
4.2	Data, methods, and research design	122
4.2.1	Data	122
4.2.2	Empirical methods	125
4.3	Results: modeling nationalizations in the oil industry	127
4.3.1	Statistical findings	127
4.3.2	Information diffusion and perceptions of survival: Iran versus Saudi Arabia	137
4.4	Conclusion	144
4.5	Appendix: model specification and additional tables	146
5	NOCs, oil revenues, and leadership survival	155
5.1	Reexamining theories of government revenue and leader survival	156
5.1.1	Stability through spending	157
5.1.2	Politics in the economy: state intervention	159
5.2	Research design and methods	163
5.2.1	Data	163
5.2.2	Testing and modeling: operational NOCs increase survival	172
5.3	Results	175

5.3.1	Nationalization increases natural resource revenue and government capture	175
5.3.2	Nationalization increases leader survival	178
5.3.3	Regime stability through resource revenues and nationalization	185
5.4	Conclusion	187
5.5	Appendix: additional figures and tables	189
6	The dynamics of nationalization in Pahlavi Iran	195
6.1	Revisiting the operational nationalization theory in the context of prerevolutionary Iran	198
6.2	Case selection, data, and design	200
6.2.1	The case of Iran in comparative context	202
6.3	Why did the Shah opt for an operational NOC?	203
6.3.1	The 1973 Agreement	203
6.3.2	Preconditions for operational nationalization	203
6.3.3	International diffusion of revenue-sharing agreements	205
6.3.4	Did the Shah think that his clock was running out?	208
6.3.5	Summary of archival findings	214
6.4	Did operational nationalization increase revenues?	215
6.4.1	Estimating and assessing counterfactual oil revenues	215
6.4.2	Results: higher oil revenues after operational nationalization	219
6.4.3	Increased capture amidst the 1974 oil price shock	221
6.5	And yet he fell	222
6.5.1	Reversal of fortunes in 1976	222
6.5.2	Why not weather the storm?	225
6.6	Conclusion	229
6.7	Appendix: BP projections and difference-in-difference results	231
7	Conclusion: the implications of nationalization	235
7.1	Nationalization as opportunism	238
7.2	Oil nationalizations in the twenty-first century	241
7.3	Resource nationalizations of the future: precious metals, minerals, and the energy transition	247
7.4	Conclusion	249
	Bibliography	250

List of Figures

2.1	Oil production before and after operational nationalization . . .	75
2.2	Hypothetical government revenues under different degrees of state intervention	77
2.3	Trajectory of annual oil and gas income in Iraq, 1958–1972 . . .	93
3.1	Operational oil nationalizations across the world, 1900–2015 . .	103
3.2	State intervention over time: percentage of global oil production, 1932–2015	108
4.1	Determinants of operational nationalization: model results from Bayesian analysis	128
4.2	Year-to-year changes in predicted probability of operational nationalization, 1959–1960 and 1973–1974	131
4.3	Predicted probabilities of operational nationalization for selected countries over time	133
4.4	Determinants of operational nationalization: revolutionary leadership	134
4.5	Oil production in the 1930–1950 period, Iran compared to Saudi Arabia	139
4.6	Ratio of collected oil revenues between foreign and host state, Iran versus Saudi Arabia, 1938–1951	143
4.7	Predicted probability of nationalization by autocratic regime type	151
4.8	Paired comparison of autocratic regime types and nationalization	152
4.9	Predicted probability of nationalization by age of the regime . .	153

5.1	Petroleum income per capita, resource revenues, and state capture	166
5.2	Resource revenues (adjusted for real oil price) before and after establishing an operational NOC	169
5.3	Leader survival and operational nationalization	171
5.4	Bayesian model results for leadership survival: posterior estimates	179
5.5	Bayesian model results for leadership survival: predicted probabilities	180
5.6	Conventional model results for leadership survival: conditional effects	183
5.7	Predicted probability of autocratic failure and transitions to democracy	186
5.8	Resource revenues before and after establishing an operational NOC	189
5.9	Predicted probability of autocratic failure using the Polity measure	190
5.10	Model results from mediation analysis of operational nationalization and resource revenues	193
5.11	Sensitivity of mediation analysis to unmeasured confounders	194
6.1	Iranian government budget operating balance, 1965–1979	213
6.2	Monthly oil production and revenues in Iran, 1970–1975	217
6.3	Actual minus counterfactual monthly oil revenues in Iran	220
6.4	Trajectory of four different BP projections of monthly Iranian oil revenue	232

List of Tables

1.1	Operational nationalization around the world, 1900–2015 . . .	34
2.1	Political outcomes of different state intervention paths in Iran and Iraq	87
3.1	Varieties of nationalization in the natural resource sector . . .	106
4.1	Determinants of operational nationalization: model results from Bayesian hierarchical logistic regression	129
4.2	Interview questions used in eliciting priors for Bayesian analysis	147
4.3	Model results from Guriev et al. (2011) analysis of oil expropriations	147
4.4	Determinants of operational nationalization: model results from OLS and logistic regression	148
4.5	Determinants of operational nationalization: Non-aligned movement membership	149
4.6	Determinants of operational nationalization: revolutionary leadership	150
4.7	Determinants of operational nationalization: relative political capacity	154
5.1	Nationalization increases resource revenues collected by the government	176
5.2	Nationalization increases state capture of natural resource revenues	177
5.3	Leader failure, oil revenues, and operational nationalization around the world, 1932–2014	181
5.4	Nationalization increases resource revenues (per capita) collected by the government	191

5.5	Mediation analysis of operational nationalization and resource revenues	192
6.1	Difference-in-difference results using OLS	234